December 12, 2019 Special Board Meeting concerning 5.0 League

Jonathan Leslie (Guest)

Steve Weber (Board)

Leslie Connolly (Board)

Abir Ray (Board)

David Keating (Board)

AJ Copeland(Board)

We had a 45 minute meeting about leveling of the NCS 5.0 league.

Leslie started the meeting by thanking Abir, Jonathan and Taimur for their work in coordinating the leagues. She then summarized the issue at hand as follows:

1. Premier League is in its inaugural/building year. It has three characteristics that are particularly salient in terms of drawing participation: a) weekend play b) skill based (as opposed to club based) teams c) a fee which serves as a commitment to play matches.
2. 5.0 League is also newly constituted. It enables players to play on weeknights at their home (or away club) in a club-based format.

Because there are a number of players who are above a 5.0 skill level who wish to play in a club-based, weeknight league, the coordinator of the 5.0 league asked if NCS would accommodate those players in the 5.0 league. There were two proposals for that accommodation: 1) change the league name to 5.5 and allow any player to join. 2) have a roster rating cap which would counterbalance any higher rated player.

A spirited discussion of these proposals ensued.

* There are 2 players that we know this would impact. There are an unknown number of players that it might impact eg, 5.0+ level players who are not yet in league or who are new to NCS. Regardless of the exact number of players, the number is relatively small.
* There was concern raised about restricting play for any members. Why wouldn’t we allow as many players to play as possible?
* There are already huge skills gaps in all leagues. Putting a cap on a league doesn’t ameliorate the skills gap unless you also put a floor. A decision about skilling of a league will not address the separate issue of competitiveness of matches.
* There was a discussion of any evidence of harm done by having a 5.5 league. There was no evidence of the 5.0 league drawing players away from Premier nor was their evidence that any captain in the 5.0 league had attempted to draw players away. In fact, there are several players who play in both leagues. Nevertheless there was fear that it might happen and that 5.0 captains could provide sufficient incentive to lure players from the Premier league, thereby undermining the Premier League trial.
* Though early successes are promising, the coordinator of the Premier league indicated that it is, in fact, very fragile and drawing on a small pool of talent. Therefore, any defection of players to another league risks the ongoing viability of both leagues.
  + Because of this, there should be some buffer provided to Premier to establish the new format.

In the end, the request to raise the cap of the 5.0 league to 5.5 was rejected by consensus. Also, the proposal to have a roster cap was also rejected.

The VP of League agreed to do a review of Premier League and 5.0 League at the end of the Season and reconsider the skilling of the 5.0 League in light of a full seasons’ play.